# Current Status of LIGO-Virgo-KAGRA + Current LVK papers



## KAGRA Feb 4

| Gravitational Wave Detector Network<br>Operational Snapshot as of Feb 04, 13:25 UTC |                     |          |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|---|---------------------|----------|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| Detector  | Status              | Duration |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| GEO 600   | Unlocked            | 2:45     |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| LIGO Hanford  | Down                | >44:15   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| LIGO Livingston   | Down                | >44:15   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <u>Virgo</u>  | Info too old        |          |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| <b>KAGRA</b>  | Down                | >44:16   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Detector status sum   | <u>LVK</u><br>links |          |  |  |  |  |  |  |

gwistat

## Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

| LIGO Hanford<br>NOHOFT<br>Duration: 2d 16:28:59<br>(prev: unknown)<br>Last updated at 22:26 | LIGO<br>Livingston<br>NOHOFT<br>Duration: 7d 08:46:59<br>(prev: unknown)<br>Last updated at 22:26 | Virgo<br>UNKNOWN<br>Duration: 21d 07:48:53<br>(prev: nohoft)<br>Last updated at 2:49 | KAGRA<br>UNKNOWN<br>Duration: 101d<br>08:10:59 (prev: nohoft)<br>Last updated at 22:26 | Thu Feb 04<br>2021<br><b>22:26:38</b><br>1296480416   |
|---|---|--|--|---|
| DMT<br>Call John Zweizig<br>2 / 15 CRITICAL   | Low-latency<br>Data<br>1/45 WARNING<br>3/45 UNKNOWN   | LIGO Data<br>Replicator<br>2/14 WARNING  | DetChar<br>Summary<br>1/22 UNKNOWN   | DetChar Jobs<br>1/16 UNKNOWN<br>Last updated at 22:26 |
| GraceDB<br>1 ok<br>Last updated at 22:26  | LVAlert<br>2 ok<br>Last updated at 22:26  | GraceDB<br>Playground<br>1 ok<br>Last updated at 22:26                               | DQSegDB<br>15 ok<br>Last updated at 22:26  | NDS<br>28 ок<br>Last updated at 22:26                 |
| gstLAL Inspiral<br>зок  | CIS<br>2 ок   | EMFollow<br>2 ок   | РуСВС Live<br>1 ок   | Auth<br>27 ок   |
| Last updated at 22:26   | Last updated at 22:26   | Last updated at 22:26  | Last updated at 22:26  | Last updated at 22:26                                 |

https://monitor.ligo.org/gwstatus

Hisaaki Shinkai 真貝寿明 大阪工業大学情報科学部

http://www.oit.ac.jp/is/shinkai/





# **Target Sensitivity & Schedule**



### "Scenario Paper" [1304.0670ver2020Jan]

LVK collaboration, Living Rev Relativ (2020) 23:3 https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s41114-020-00026-9

01 (2015/9/12 - 2016/1/19) 02 (2016/11/30 - 2017/8/25) O3a (2019/4/1 - 2019/9/30) O3b (2019/10/1 - 2020/3/27)

LIGO LIGO+Virgo LIGO+Virgo LIGO+Virgo + KAGRA







### National Geographic Universe Reference Map

# 銀河系スケール から 銀河群スケールへ

1 pc = 3.26光年 (年周視差1秒角となる距離)

天の川銀河 直径 10万光年 32.5 kpc

大マゼラン雲 (LMC) 50 kpc 小マゼラン雲 (SMC) 61 kpc

アンドロメダ銀河 (M31) 0.79 Mpc=250万光年

おとめ座銀河団(Virgo Cluster) 16.5 Mpc=5380万光年





# 銀河団スケール から 大規模構造 へ





加工]

おとめ座銀河団(Virgo Cluster) 16.5 Mpc=5380万光年

CfA2 Great Wall 110-160 Mpc = 3.5-5.5 億光年

**Sloan Great Wall** 300 Mpc = 10 億光年

Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

Innovative Area (FY2017-2021)

### 新学術領域研究 重力波物理学・天文学:創世記

本新学術領域研究も4年目に入ろうとしています。重力波直接観測による重力波物理学・天文学は、アメリカの重 力波干渉計 LIGO が 2015 年 9 月 14 日に連星ブラックホールの重力波を検出したことによって始まりました。その 後、イタリアーフランスが共同で進めている Virgo が観測を再開するや否や 2017 年 8 月 17 日に連星中性子星から の重力波が観測され、重力波研究はさらなる盛り上がりを見せています。2019 年 4 月には LIGO による 3 度目の長 期連続観測 O3(Virgo も共同参加)が始まり、重力波である可能性の高い信号が 40 以上報告されています。O3 は 2020年4月末まで観測が継続する予定で、日本のグループを含め、様々な観測手段を用いた精力的なフォローアッ プ観測が進行していますが、03 では電磁波対応天体を同定するには至っていません。そのような中でも、これまで 考えられていたよりも2割から3割程度質量の大きな連星中性子星合体から放出されたと思われる重力波の検出 (GW190425)が報告されています。このような予想外の質量をもつ連星の発見は連星系形成のシナリオに対して、新 しい謎をもたらすものとして注目されています。日本の重力波観測装置である KAGRA も O3 に参加をすることを目 指して感度の向上が進められています。KAGRA が LIGO/Virgo と正式に共同観測を進めるための枠組みについての取 り決めも整いました。今回のニュースレターでは、このあたりの経緯についての解説記事を特集しました。

> 領域代表 京都大学・大学院理学研究科・教授 田中貴浩(たなか たかひろ)

### KAGRA 観測開始へ

科研費

大阪工業大学情報科学部・教授 真貝寿明(しんかい ひさあき)



KAGRA(かぐら)は、岐阜県神岡にある重力波検出の ためのレーザー干渉計です。一辺が3kmの腕をもつ装 置で、地面振動を抑えるために地下に建設され、熱振動 を抑えるために20Kの極低温で運転される「天文台」 です。10年の年月をかけて、トンネルの掘削・装置のイ ンストール・試運転等を進め、2019年10月に完成記念 式典を行ないました。同日、重力波観測をリードしてい る米国の LIGO、欧州の Virgo の研究グループと共同観測 協定 (Memorandum of Agreement, MoA) に調印し、LVK の3者による共同研究をスタートさせました。現在、 KAGRA はノイズ除去などの最終調整中で、2019 年 12 月には試運転を実施し、共同観測へ参加できるよう準備

### を急いでいます。ここでは、KAGRA のこれまでの歩み と現状を紹介します<sup>1</sup>。

KAGRA 以前の日本の重力波検出プロジェクト 日本での重力波直接検出の試みは、1970年代から始 まりました。90年代には東京大学宇宙線研究所が 100 m 長の delay-line Michelson 干渉計(TENKO-100) を、国立天文台が 20 m 長の Fabry-Perot 型 Michelson 干渉計をそれぞれ構築し、技術的検討を行いました。前 者は光を102回往復させ、800 Hz から2.5 kHz の周波数 帯で1.1×10<sup>-19</sup>/√Hzの感度を出しています。1995年 には、300m長のFabry-Perot型Michelson干渉計TAMA が国立天文台に建設され、98 年には 5 × 10<sup>-21</sup>/ √Hz の 感度を達成しました。TAMA は、2001 年には 1000 時 間以上の運転を行い、2002年には米国 LIGOの S2 観測 と2ヶ月間共同で行うなどの実績を残し、最終的な感度 は、1 kHz 付近で 1.3 × 10<sup>-21</sup>/ √Hz を記録しています。 レーザー光増幅や地面振動減衰装置などの将来技術開発 も行われました。

執筆者は A01 班に所属する研究分担者ですが、現在 KAGRA サイエンス部門会議(KAGRA Scientific Congress)実行委員長 も担当しており、本稿は後者の立場で執筆します。 本稿は、2019年12月初旬に執筆しました。

Genesis vol. 3 I 01 02 I Genesis vol. 3

TAMA のある国立天文台は、東京都内にあり、地面振 動や生活雑音のために、100 Hz 以下では感度が望めま せんでした。そこで岐阜県神岡の鉱山跡地の山中に建設 することが計画されました。予備的なプロジェクトとし て、20 m のプロトタイプ干渉計

に移設され、LISM<sup>2</sup>と命名されて2 と同時観測を行っています。

### KAGRA プロジェクト

2002年には、100m長の辺を 20 Kの温度に冷却することができ され、CLIO<sup>3</sup>と命名されます。200 運用され、東京より2桁以上も地 とが示されました。このように、日 ドするものでしたが、km-スケー 干渉計LCGT<sup>4</sup>建設は巨費ゆえ(そ に一例もなかったため)なかなか でした。梶田隆章氏が宇宙線研究 任し、自らが重力波研究を牽引す がる潮流ができました。LCGT計 建設費140億円が承認され、東日 しましたが、2012年にトンネル LCGT の名前は一般公募によって た。「神岡(Kamioka)重力波(Gl 文台」が由来ですが、日本人なら 命名です。

図1は、KAGRA の概要図です。 ニュートリノ検出器 Super-Kamiok 同じ山の中に建設され、研究所も されました。一辺が3kmのレー<sup>・</sup> 干渉計に比べ、技術的に次の2点 です。一つは低周波数側での地面 下に建設されたこと。KAGRA は

2 Laser Interferometer Small Obser 3 Cryogenic Laser Interferometer C 4 Large-scale Cryogenic Gravitatio

10-13  $10^{-14}$  $10^{-19}$  $10^{-1}$ |₽ 10<sup>-17</sup>.  $\geq 10^{-18}$ 10<sup>-19</sup>

> $10^{-20}$ 10-21

> > 10-22 10-23

太氏作成]

Genesis Newsletter Vol.3 (March 2020)



### Topics

インとなる冷却装置などのインストールを行い、2018 的な光学系装置や高出力レーザー源などすべての装置の 年4月・5月には関係者が bKAGRA (baseline KAGRA) *phase-1* と呼ぶ試運転を9日間行いました。鏡を18K に冷却するのに5週間ほどかかること、そしてその温度 を1カ月以上保てることを実証しています。この試運転 の後半は、台風なみの低気圧の襲来やハワイでの火山活 動や地震に悩まされましたが、前半は稼働率が 88.6%を 記録するなど安定な運用が報告されました。ただし、干 渉計の感度は低周波領域で TAMA をやっと追い抜くこと ができる程度でした。

と断定することは難しいため、KAGRA は LIGO/Virgo の 予定している観測予定期間 03(2019年4月から1年) に間に合うように準備を進めることになりました。補助



図 2: KAGRA の感度曲線(小さいほど感度が良い)。iKAGRA (2016年4月)、bKAGRA-1(2018年4月)の試運転 後、すべての装置をインストールして、2019 年 8 月 23 日に初ロック。以降、調整が続けられていて、本稿執筆 時の12月初旬現在では、連星中性子星の観測領域 31 kpc まで到達している。LIGO/Virgo との共同観測に 入るためには、1 Mpc 以上の感度が必要である。[道村唯

インストールを半年以上予定を早めて 2019 年 4 月に終 了し、現在は、装置の最終調整(commissioning)とノ イズ除去(noise hunting)作業を進めています(この期 間を phase-2 と呼んでいます)。装置の調整とは、光源 側と検出器側のリサイクリング装置を稼動させること、制 震装置にフィードバックシステムを入れること、重力波 信号のゼロ点更正を行ったり(calibration)、出力信号の 質保証を行うこと(detector characterization)、データ 転送系を整備することなどを指し、ノイズ除去とは、機 一台の干渉計だけでは、重力波信号を確実にとらえた 器や周辺環境から発生するノイズの原因を特定しそれを ーつーつ無くしていく作業です。

> 2019 年 8 月 23 日には、(リサイクリング装置なしの 構成ですが)初めて干渉計全体がロックし、感度曲線を 出すことができました(図2)。本稿執筆時の12月初旬 では、連星中性子星の観測領域 31 kpc まで到達してい ます。目標の感度は、O3 観測期に 10 Mpc ですので、あ と3桁の感度向上が必要で、干渉計チームが日々努力を 続けています。

### KAGRA と LIGO-Virgo

KAGRA が 03 への参加検討を始めたのは、2017 年 12月でした。本新学術領域研究の田中貴浩代表からは、 2018年3月21日に KAGRA に向けて、「KAGRA の 03 参加が実現することを強く望んでいる」とのバックアッ プメッセージを寄せていただきました。LIGO/Virgo 側か らは、KAGRA の参加について歓迎の返信を即座に受け 取り、本格的な共同研究体制を築くことになりました。

冒頭で紹介しましたように、LIGO/Virgo/KAGRA は、 共同観測・共同研究を行なっていく MoA に調印しまし た(図 3、図 4)。KAGRA の観測装置がまだ稼動してお らず、データ解析グループも共同研究を本格的に進めて いない状況にも関わらず、対等の条件での協定を認めて くれたことに感謝すると共に、相応の貢献がこれから求 められていることを感じています。(なお、協定には、 KAGRA 干渉計が観測に加わるための条件が付記されま



図3:2019年10月4日、富山にて行われたLIGO-Virgo-KAGRA 共同観測協定の調印式での記念撮影。 左から EGO 副代 表 Christian Olivetto、Virgo スポークスパーソン Jo van den Brand、KAGRA 組織代表 梶田隆章、LIGO 所長 David Reitze、KSC 実行委員長 真貝、KAGRA 組織副 代表 大橋正健。[写真提供 飛騨市]



図 4: 観測スケジュール。現在の Observation 3の期間は、2020 をアップデートし、O4 を開始する。

した。少なくとも第1世代干渉計 GEO600 を上回らな いと、協定の価値に疑問が持たれることから、感度が中 性子星連星合体の観測距離1 Mpc を超えること、とされ ています。その他、いくつかのデータ信号に関する内部 す)。

KAGRA グループに所属する研究者は、LIGO/Virgo と 野を開拓されることも可能です。 のネット会議(telecon)に参加し、データや文書を交換 する体制になりました。各種のネット会議が日々開催さ れていて、日本時間では深夜や早朝になることもありま すが、研究体制がかなり変わりました。LIGO/Virgoのコ

5 http://gwwiki.icrr.u-tokyo.ac.jp/JGWwiki/KAGRA

Topics

| 月時)    |      |       |       |
|--------|------|-------|-------|
|        | LIGO | Virgo | KAGRA |
| 登録研究者数 | 1330 | 465   | 365   |
| 論文著者数  | 860  | 360   | 200   |
| グループ数  | 101  | 96    | 110   |
| 参加国数   | 20   | 8     | 14    |
|        |      |       |       |

ラボレーション会議(所属者のみ参加可能)は毎年3月 と9月に開催されていて、350名ほどの参加者がありま す。今後は、KAGRA 研究者もこれに加わり、いずれ日 本でも開催されることになります。3つのグループの規 模を表1にまとめました。各グループとも、研究者数の 約半数が、データ解析に関わる人々です。

本新学術領域研究に参画している研究者のうち、多く の方がKAGRA コラボレーションにも参加しています。こ れから研究参加することに興味を持たれた方は、是非、研 究者向けの wiki ページ<sup>5</sup> にアクセスされ、ご検討くださ い。相応の予算のかかった大人数のプロジェクトで、国 際的なネットワークとして責任をもって貢献していくた めに、ある程度、ルールが定められておりますが、その 点はご理解いただきたいと存じます。例えば、コラボレー 年4月末まで。その後、1年半の期間に各干渉計は装置 ションに新規グループとして参加するときには、研究計 画を KAGRA 内部の会議 (Face-to-Face meeting) で表 明していただき、審査を受ける必要があります。また、論 文のデフォルト著者となるためには、KAGRA に対する 貢献に関して毎年内部審査を通過しなければなりません。 「理論の研究者でも参加できるのか」とよく質問を受けま レビューをクリアすれば、その日から共同観測となりますが、論文を書く指針やレビュー・将来設計その他に貢 献していただくことが期待されています。ご自身で新分

> 重力波の生のデータに接し、まさに日々、重力波天文 学が創成期を迎えていることを実感しています。研究者 冥利に尽きる時期にいる、と言えるでしょう。 KAGRA の感度は2月11日現在、234kpc に到達した。 2月25日から観測を開始する予定である。

表1:LIGO, Virgo, KAGRA 研究グループの概要(2019年10







## ◀ Genesis Newsletter Vol.3 (March 2020)

 $10^{-14}$ FPMI 08/24/19 4.0x10<sup>-4</sup> Mpc FPMI 10/08/19 1.7x10<sup>-3</sup> Mpc  $10^{-15}$ FPMI 11/01/19 3.9x10<sup>-3</sup> Mpc FPMI 12/06/19 3.1x10<sup>-2</sup> Mpc Aug 24, 2019 PRFPMI 02/04/20 2.7x10<sup>-2</sup> Mpc  $10^{-16}$ PRFPMI 02/05/20 4.7x10<sup>-2</sup> Mpc PRFPMI 02/11/20 1.8x10<sup>-1</sup> Mpc Strain  $10^{-17}$   $10^{-17}$   $10^{-18}$ PRFPMI 02/14/20 3.4x10<sup>-1</sup> Mpc PRFPMI 03/19/20 6.9x10<sup>-1</sup> Mpc PRFPMI 03/26/20 9.6x10<sup>-1</sup> Mpc Dec 19, 2019  $10^{-19}$  $10^{-20}$  $10^{-21}$ March 26, 2020  $10^{-22} + 10^{1}$  $10^{3}$  $10^{2}$ Frequency [Hz]

▼KAGRA actual



# What's in 2021?

Five years ago, GW physics was a "future story". People did not know the existence of BBH, BH over 10 solar mass (except SMBH). Now LIGO/Virgo announced 50 events in October 2020 as GWTC-2 up to their O3a.



2021 Spring : O3a final analysis

- : O3a data release
- : O3b catalog
- 2021 Fall : O3b final analysis
  - : O3b data release

2021

LIGO Hanford: Upgrade LIGO Livingston: Upgrade Virgo : Upgrade -> Test Run KAGRA : Upgrade

2022 June or later LVK O4 start









GW150914: the first ever detection of gravitational waves from the merger of two black holes more than a billion light years away

https://media.ligo.northwestern.edu/gallery/mass-plot

Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

# 01 (2015/9/12 - 2016/1/19) Masses in the Stellar Graveyard in Solar Masses

LIGO-Virgo Black Holes 9 EM Black Holes GWTC-2 plot v1.0 LIGO-Virgo | Frank Elavsky, Aaron Geller | Northwestern





# O2 (2016/11/30 - 2017/8/25)



- by dozens of telescopes across the entire electromagnetic spectrum.

https://media.ligo.northwestern.edu/gallery/mass-plot

Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

After O2 : GWTC1 (2018/12/3 released)

10 BHBH 1 NSNS

GW170814: the first GW signal measured by the three-detector network, also from a binary black hole (BBH) merger; • GW170817: the first GW signal measured from a binary neutron star (BNS) merger — and also the first event observed in light,





- GW190412: the first BBH with definitively asymmetric component masses, which also shows evidence for higher harmonics
- GW190425: the second gravitational-wave event consistent with a BNS, following GW170817
- GW190426 152155: a low-mass event consistent with either an NSBH or BBH
- GW190514\_065416: a BBH with the smallest effective aligned spin of all O3a events
- GW190517\_055101: a BBH with the largest effective aligned spin of all O3a events
- GW190521: a BBH with total mass over 150 times the mass of the Sun
- GW190814: a highly asymmetric system of ambiguous nature, corresponding to the merger of a 23 solar mass black hole with a 2.6 solar mass compact object, making the latter either the lightest black hole or heaviest neutron star observed in a compact binary
- GW190924 021846: likely the lowest-mass BBH, with both black holes exceeding 3 solar masses

## After O3a : GWTC2 (2020/10/28 released)

46 BHBH

# 2 NSNS 2 BH+?

# GWTC-2(突発的重力波カタログ2)

# **Gravitational Wave Transient Catalog 2**

arXiv:2010.14527 https://dcc.ligo.org/LIGO-P2000223/public

39 events in O3a

36BHBH, 1 NSNS, 2 BH+unknown

# GWyymmdd\_hhmmss for new events

# False-Alarm Rate < 2/1yr

- GW190412: the first BBH with definitively asymmetric component masses, which also shows evidence for higher harmonics
- GW190425: the second gravitational-wave event consistent with a BNS, following GW170817
- GW190426\_152155: a low-mass event consistent with either an NSBH or BBH
- GW190514\_065416: a BBH with the smallest effective aligned spin of all O3a events
- GW190517\_055101: a BBH with the largest effective aligned spin of all O3a events
- GW190521: a BBH with total mass over 150 times the mass of the Sun
- GW190814: a highly asymmetric system of ambiguous nature, corresponding to the merger of a 23 solar mass black hole with a 2.6 solar mass compact object, making the latter either the lightest black hole or heaviest neutron star observed in a compact binary
- GW190924\_021846: likely the lowest-mass BBH, with both black holes exceeding 3 solar masses

arXiv:2010.14529 Test of GR

arXiv:2010.14533 Population properties

| Event                    | $\stackrel{M}{(M_{\odot})}$     | $\mathcal{M} \atop (M_{\odot})$ | ${m_1 \atop (M_{\odot})}$       | ${m_2 \atop (M_{\odot})}$       | $\chi_{ m eff}$                 | $D_{\rm L}$<br>(Gpc)            | z                               | $\stackrel{M_{\mathrm{f}}}{(M_{\odot})}$ | $\chi_{ m f}$                   | $\frac{\Delta\Omega}{(\deg^2)}$ | $\operatorname{SNR}$          |
|--------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|--|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| $GW190408_{-}181802$     | $42.9\substack{+4.1 \\ -2.9}$   | $18.3\substack{+1.8 \\ -1.2}$   | $24.5^{+5.1}_{-3.4}$            | $18.3^{+3.2}_{-3.5}$            | $-0.03\substack{+0.13\\-0.19}$  | $1.58\substack{+0.40 \\ -0.59}$ | $0.30\substack{+0.06 \\ -0.10}$ | $41.0^{+3.8}_{-2.7}$                     | $0.67\substack{+0.06 \\ -0.07}$ | 140                             | $15.3\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.3}$ |
| GW190412                 | $38.4\substack{+3.8\-3.7}$      | $13.3\substack{+0.4\\-0.3}$     | $30.0\substack{+4.7 \\ -5.1}$   | $8.3\substack{+1.6 \\ -0.9}$    | $0.25\substack{+0.08\\-0.11}$   | $0.74\substack{+0.14 \\ -0.17}$ | $0.15\substack{+0.03 \\ -0.03}$ | $37.3^{+3.9}_{-3.9}$                     | $0.67\substack{+0.05 \\ -0.06}$ | 21                              | $18.9\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.3}$ |
| $\rm GW190413\_052954$   | $56.9^{+13.1}_{-8.9}$           | $24.0\substack{+5.4 \\ -3.7}$   | $33.4\substack{+12.4 \\ -7.4}$  | $23.4^{+6.7}_{-6.3}$            | $0.01\substack{+0.29 \\ -0.33}$ | $4.10\substack{+2.41 \\ -1.89}$ | $0.66\substack{+0.30 \\ -0.27}$ | $54.3^{+12.4}_{-8.4}$                    | $0.69\substack{+0.12 \\ -0.13}$ | 1400                            | $8.9\substack{+0.4\\-0.8}$    |
| $\rm GW190413\_134308$   | $76.1\substack{+15.9 \\ -10.6}$ | $31.9\substack{+7.3 \\ -4.6}$   | $45.4^{+13.6}_{-9.6}$           | $30.9\substack{+10.2\\-9.6}$    | $-0.01\substack{+0.24\\-0.28}$  | $5.15\substack{+2.44 \\ -2.34}$ | $0.80\substack{+0.30 \\ -0.31}$ | $72.8\substack{+15.2 \\ -10.3}$          | $0.69\substack{+0.10 \\ -0.12}$ | 520                             | $10.0\substack{+0.4 \\ -0.5}$ |
| $GW190421_{-}213856$     | $71.8\substack{+12.5 \\ -8.6}$  | $30.7\substack{+5.5 \\ -3.9}$   | $40.6\substack{+10.4 \\ -6.6}$  | $31.4_{-8.2}^{+7.5}$            | $-0.05\substack{+0.23\\-0.26}$  | $3.15^{+1.37}_{-1.42}$          | $0.53\substack{+0.18 \\ -0.21}$ | $68.6\substack{+11.7 \\ -8.1}$           | $0.68\substack{+0.10\\-0.11}$   | 1000                            | $10.7\substack{+0.2\\-0.4}$   |
| $\rm GW190424\_180648$   | $70.7\substack{+13.4 \\ -9.8}$  | $30.3\substack{+5.7 \\ -4.2}$   | $39.5\substack{+10.9 \\ -6.9}$  | $31.0\substack{+7.4 \\ -7.3}$   | $0.15\substack{+0.22\\-0.22}$   | $2.55\substack{+1.56 \\ -1.33}$ | $0.45\substack{+0.22 \\ -0.21}$ | $67.1\substack{+12.5\\-9.2}$             | $0.75\substack{+0.08 \\ -0.09}$ | 26000                           | $10.4\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.4}$ |
| GW190425                 | $3.4\substack{+0.3 \\ -0.1}$    | $1.44\substack{+0.02\\-0.02}$   | $2.0\substack{+0.6 \\ -0.3}$    | $1.4\substack{+0.3 \\ -0.3}$    | $0.06\substack{+0.11 \\ -0.05}$ | $0.16\substack{+0.07 \\ -0.07}$ | $0.03\substack{+0.01 \\ -0.02}$ | -  | -                               | 9900                            | $12.4\substack{+0.3 \\ -0.4}$ |
| $\rm GW190426\_152155$   | $7.2\substack{+3.5 \\ -1.5}$    | $2.41\substack{+0.08 \\ -0.08}$ | $5.7^{+4.0}_{-2.3}$             | $1.5\substack{+0.8 \\ -0.5}$    | $-0.03\substack{+0.33\\-0.30}$  | $0.38\substack{+0.19 \\ -0.16}$ | $0.08\substack{+0.04 \\ -0.03}$ | -  | -                               | 1400                            | $8.7\substack{+0.5 \\ -0.6}$  |
| $\rm GW190503_{-}185404$ | $71.3\substack{+9.3 \\ -8.0}$   | $30.1^{+4.2}_{-4.0}$            | $42.9\substack{+9.2 \\ -7.8}$   | $28.5\substack{+7.5 \\ -7.9}$   | $-0.02\substack{+0.20\\-0.26}$  | $1.52\substack{+0.71 \\ -0.66}$ | $0.29\substack{+0.11 \\ -0.11}$ | $68.2\substack{+8.7 \\ -7.5}$            | $0.67\substack{+0.09 \\ -0.12}$ | 94                              | $12.4\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.3}$ |
| $\rm GW190512\_180714$   | $35.6\substack{+3.9 \\ -3.4}$   | $14.5^{+1.3}_{-1.0}$            | $23.0\substack{+5.4 \\ -5.7}$   | $12.5\substack{+3.5 \\ -2.5}$   | $0.03\substack{+0.13 \\ -0.13}$ | $1.49\substack{+0.53 \\ -0.59}$ | $0.28\substack{+0.09 \\ -0.10}$ | $34.2^{+3.9}_{-3.4}$                     | $0.65\substack{+0.07 \\ -0.07}$ | 230                             | $12.2\substack{+0.2\\-0.4}$   |
| $GW190513_{-205428}$     | $53.6\substack{+8.6 \\ -5.9}$   | $21.5^{+3.6}_{-1.9}$            | $35.3\substack{+9.6 \\ -9.0}$   | $18.1\substack{+7.3 \\ -4.2}$   | $0.12\substack{+0.29 \\ -0.18}$ | $2.16\substack{+0.94 \\ -0.80}$ | $0.39\substack{+0.14 \\ -0.13}$ | $51.3^{+8.1}_{-5.8}$                     | $0.69\substack{+0.14 \\ -0.12}$ | 490                             | $12.9\substack{+0.3\\-0.4}$   |
| $GW190514\_065416$       | $64.2\substack{+16.6\\-9.6}$    | $27.4\substack{+6.9 \\ -4.3}$   | $36.9^{+13.4}_{-7.3}$           | $27.5^{+8.2}_{-7.7}$            | $-0.16\substack{+0.28\\-0.32}$  | $4.93^{+2.76}_{-2.41}$          | $0.77\substack{+0.34 \\ -0.33}$ | $61.6^{+16.0}_{-9.2}$                    | $0.64\substack{+0.11\\-0.14}$   | 2400                            | $8.2\substack{+0.3\\-0.6}$    |
| $GW190517_{-}055101$     | $61.9\substack{+10.0\\-9.6}$    | $26.0\substack{+4.2 \\ -4.0}$   | $36.4^{+11.8}_{-7.8}$           | $24.8\substack{+6.9 \\ -7.1}$   | $0.53\substack{+0.20 \\ -0.19}$ | $2.11\substack{+1.79 \\ -1.00}$ | $0.38\substack{+0.26 \\ -0.16}$ | $57.8^{+9.4}_{-9.1}$                     | $0.87\substack{+0.05 \\ -0.07}$ | 460                             | $10.7\substack{+0.4\\-0.6}$   |
| $\rm GW190519\_153544$   | $104.2\substack{+14.5\\-14.9}$  | $43.5^{+6.8}_{-6.8}$            | $64.5\substack{+11.3 \\ -13.2}$ | $39.9\substack{+11.0 \\ -10.6}$ | $0.33\substack{+0.19 \\ -0.22}$ | $2.85\substack{+2.02 \\ -1.14}$ | $0.49\substack{+0.27 \\ -0.17}$ | $98.7\substack{+13.5 \\ -14.2}$          | $0.80\substack{+0.07\\-0.12}$   | 770                             | $15.6\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.3}$ |
| GW190521                 | $157.9\substack{+37.4\\-20.9}$  | $66.9^{+15.5}_{-9.2}$           | $91.4\substack{+29.3 \\ -17.5}$ | $66.8\substack{+20.7\\-20.7}$   | $0.06\substack{+0.31 \\ -0.37}$ | $4.53^{+2.30}_{-2.13}$          | $0.72\substack{+0.29 \\ -0.29}$ | $150.3^{+35.8}_{-20.0}$                  | $^{8}_{0}0.73^{+0.11}_{-0.14}$  | 940                             | $14.2\substack{+0.3\\-0.3}$   |
| $GW190521\_074359$       | $74.4\substack{+6.8 \\ -4.6}$   | $31.9\substack{+3.1 \\ -2.4}$   | $42.1\substack{+5.9 \\ -4.9}$   | $32.7^{+5.4}_{-6.2}$            | $0.09\substack{+0.10 \\ -0.13}$ | $1.28\substack{+0.38 \\ -0.57}$ | $0.25\substack{+0.06 \\ -0.10}$ | $70.7\substack{+6.4 \\ -4.2}$            | $0.72\substack{+0.05 \\ -0.07}$ | 500                             | $25.8\substack{+0.1 \\ -0.2}$ |
| $\rm GW190527\_092055$   | $58.5\substack{+27.9 \\ -10.6}$ | $24.2^{+11.9}_{-4.4}$           | $36.2^{+19.1}_{-9.5}$           | $22.8^{+12.7}_{-8.1}$           | $0.13\substack{+0.29 \\ -0.28}$ | $3.10\substack{+4.85\\-1.64}$   | $0.53\substack{+0.61 \\ -0.25}$ | $55.9\substack{+26.4\\-10.1}$            | $0.73\substack{+0.12 \\ -0.16}$ | 3800                            | $8.1^{+0.4}_{-1.0}$           |
| $\rm GW190602\_175927$   | $114.1^{+18.5}_{-15.7}$         | $48.3^{+8.6}_{-8.0}$            | $67.2\substack{+16.0\\-12.6}$   | $47.4^{+13.4}_{-16.6}$          | $0.10\substack{+0.25\\-0.25}$   | $2.99\substack{+2.02 \\ -1.26}$ | $0.51\substack{+0.27 \\ -0.19}$ | $108.8^{+17.2}_{-14.8}$                  | $^2_{8}0.71^{+0.10}_{-0.13}$    | 720                             | $12.8\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.3}$ |
| $GW190620_{-}030421$     | $90.1\substack{+17.3 \\ -12.1}$ | $37.5^{+7.8}_{-5.7}$            | $55.4^{+15.8}_{-12.0}$          | $35.0^{+11.6}_{-11.4}$          | $0.34\substack{+0.21 \\ -0.25}$ | $3.16\substack{+1.67\\-1.43}$   | $0.54\substack{+0.22\\-0.21}$   | $85.4^{+15.9}_{-11.4}$                   | $0.80\substack{+0.08 \\ -0.14}$ | 6700                            | $12.1\substack{+0.3\\-0.4}$   |
| $\rm GW190630\_185205$   | $58.8\substack{+4.7 \\ -4.8}$   | $24.8^{+2.1}_{-2.0}$            | $35.0\substack{+6.9\\-5.7}$     | $23.6\substack{+5.2 \\ -5.1}$   | $0.10\substack{+0.12 \\ -0.13}$ | $0.93\substack{+0.56\\-0.40}$   | $0.19\substack{+0.10 \\ -0.07}$ | $56.1^{+4.5}_{-4.6}$                     | $0.70\substack{+0.06 \\ -0.07}$ | 1300                            | $15.6\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.3}$ |
| $GW190701_{-203306}$     | $94.1\substack{+11.6 \\ -9.3}$  | $40.2\substack{+5.2 \\ -4.7}$   | $53.6\substack{+11.7 \\ -7.8}$  | $40.8^{+8.3}_{-11.5}$           | $-0.06\substack{+0.23\\-0.28}$  | $2.14\substack{+0.79 \\ -0.73}$ | $0.38\substack{+0.12 \\ -0.12}$ | $90.0\substack{+10.8\\-8.6}$             | $0.67\substack{+0.09 \\ -0.12}$ | 45                              | $11.3\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.4}$ |
| $GW190706_{-222641}$     | $101.6\substack{+17.9\\-13.5}$  | $42.0^{+8.4}_{-6.2}$            | $64.0\substack{+15.2\\-15.2}$   | $38.5^{+12.5}_{-12.4}$          | $0.32\substack{+0.25 \\ -0.30}$ | $5.07^{+2.57}_{-2.11}$          | $0.79\substack{+0.31 \\ -0.28}$ | $96.3\substack{+16.7 \\ -13.2}$          | $0.80\substack{+0.08 \\ -0.17}$ | 610                             | $12.6\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.4}$ |
| $GW190707_{-}093326$     | $20.0\substack{+1.9 \\ -1.3}$   | $8.5^{+0.6}_{-0.4}$             | $11.5^{+3.3}_{-1.7}$            | $8.4^{+1.4}_{-1.6}$             | $-0.05\substack{+0.10\\-0.08}$  | $0.80\substack{+0.37 \\ -0.38}$ | $0.16\substack{+0.07 \\ -0.07}$ | $19.2\substack{+1.9 \\ -1.3}$            | $0.66\substack{+0.03 \\ -0.04}$ | 1300                            | $13.3\substack{+0.2\\-0.4}$   |
| $GW190708\_232457$       | $30.8\substack{+2.5 \\ -1.8}$   | $13.1\substack{+0.9 \\ -0.6}$   | $17.5^{+4.7}_{-2.3}$            | $13.1\substack{+2.0 \\ -2.7}$   | $0.02\substack{+0.10\\-0.08}$   | $0.90\substack{+0.33 \\ -0.40}$ | $0.18\substack{+0.06 \\ -0.07}$ | $29.4^{+2.5}_{-1.7}$                     | $0.69\substack{+0.04\\-0.04}$   | 14000                           | $13.1\substack{+0.2\\-0.3}$   |
| $GW190719_{-215514}$     | $55.8^{+16.3}_{-10.0}$          | $22.7^{+5.9}_{-3.7}$            | $35.2\substack{+16.9 \\ -9.9}$  | $20.2^{+8.1}_{-6.5}$            | $0.35\substack{+0.28\\-0.32}$   | $4.61^{+2.84}_{-2.17}$          | $0.73\substack{+0.35 \\ -0.30}$ | $52.9^{+15.6}_{-9.5}$                    | $0.80\substack{+0.10 \\ -0.16}$ | 2300                            | $8.3^{+0.3}_{-1.0}$           |
| $\rm GW190720\_000836$   | $21.3\substack{+4.3 \\ -2.3}$   | $8.9\substack{+0.5 \\ -0.8}$    | $13.3\substack{+6.6 \\ -3.0}$   | $7.8^{+2.2}_{-2.2}$             | $0.18\substack{+0.14 \\ -0.12}$ | $0.81\substack{+0.71 \\ -0.33}$ | $0.16\substack{+0.12 \\ -0.06}$ | $20.3\substack{+4.5 \\ -2.3}$            | $0.72\substack{+0.06\\-0.05}$   | 510                             | $11.0\substack{+0.3 \\ -0.8}$ |
| $GW190727_{-}060333$     | $65.8\substack{+10.9 \\ -7.4}$  | $28.1\substack{+4.9 \\ -3.4}$   | $37.2^{+9.4}_{-5.9}$            | $28.8\substack{+6.6 \\ -7.9}$   | $0.12\substack{+0.26 \\ -0.25}$ | $3.60^{+1.56}_{-1.51}$          | $0.60\substack{+0.20 \\ -0.22}$ | $62.6\substack{+10.2 \\ -7.0}$           | $0.73\substack{+0.10 \\ -0.10}$ | 860                             | $11.9\substack{+0.3 \\ -0.5}$ |
| $\rm GW190728\_064510$   | $20.5\substack{+4.5 \\ -1.3}$   | $8.6\substack{+0.5 \\ -0.3}$    | $12.2\substack{+7.1 \\ -2.2}$   | $8.1^{+1.7}_{-2.6}$             | $0.12\substack{+0.19 \\ -0.07}$ | $0.89\substack{+0.25\\-0.37}$   | $0.18\substack{+0.05 \\ -0.07}$ | $19.5\substack{+4.6\\-1.3}$              | $0.71\substack{+0.04\\-0.04}$   | 410                             | $13.0\substack{+0.2\\-0.4}$   |
| $GW190731_{-}140936$     | $67.1\substack{+15.3 \\ -10.2}$ | $28.4\substack{+6.8 \\ -4.5}$   | $39.3^{+11.8}_{-8.2}$           | $28.0\substack{+8.9 \\ -8.4}$   | $0.08\substack{+0.24\\-0.24}$   | $3.97^{+2.56}_{-2.07}$          | $0.65\substack{+0.32 \\ -0.30}$ | $63.9\substack{+14.4\\-9.8}$             | $0.71\substack{+0.10 \\ -0.12}$ | 3000                            | $8.6\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.5}$  |
| $\rm GW190803\_022701$   | $62.7\substack{+11.8 \\ -8.4}$  | $26.7^{+5.2}_{-3.8}$            | $36.1\substack{+10.2 \\ -6.7}$  | $26.7\substack{+7.1 \\ -7.6}$   | $-0.01\substack{+0.25\\-0.26}$  | $3.69^{+2.04}_{-1.69}$          | $0.61\substack{+0.26 \\ -0.24}$ | $59.9\substack{+11.2 \\ -7.9}$           | $0.69\substack{+0.10\\-0.11}$   | 1500                            | $8.6\substack{+0.3 \\ -0.5}$  |
| GW190814                 | $25.8\substack{+1.0 \\ -0.9}$   | $6.09\substack{+0.06 \\ -0.06}$ | $23.2\substack{+1.1 \\ -1.0}$   | $2.59\substack{+0.08 \\ -0.09}$ | $0.00\substack{+0.06\\-0.06}$   | $0.24\substack{+0.04 \\ -0.05}$ | $0.05\substack{+0.009\\-0.010}$ | $25.6\substack{+1.0 \\ -0.9}$            | $0.28\substack{+0.02\\-0.02}$   | 19                              | $24.9\substack{+0.1 \\ -0.2}$ |
| $GW190828\_063405$       | $57.5\substack{+7.5 \\ -4.4}$   | $24.8^{+3.3}_{-2.0}$            | $31.8\substack{+5.8 \\ -3.9}$   | $25.9\substack{+4.4\\-4.6}$     | $0.19\substack{+0.15 \\ -0.16}$ | $2.22\substack{+0.63 \\ -0.95}$ | $0.40\substack{+0.09\\-0.15}$   | $54.5\substack{+6.9 \\ -4.0}$            | $0.76\substack{+0.06 \\ -0.07}$ | 520                             | $16.2\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.3}$ |
| $GW190828_{-}065509$     | $34.1\substack{+5.5 \\ -4.5}$   | $13.3\substack{+1.2 \\ -0.9}$   | $23.8\substack{+7.2 \\ -7.0}$   | $10.2\substack{+3.5 \\ -2.1}$   | $0.08\substack{+0.16\\-0.16}$   | $1.66\substack{+0.63 \\ -0.61}$ | $0.31\substack{+0.10 \\ -0.10}$ | $32.9\substack{+5.7 \\ -4.5}$            | $0.65\substack{+0.09 \\ -0.08}$ | 640                             | $10.0\substack{+0.3 \\ -0.5}$ |
| $GW190909_{-}114149$     | $71.2\substack{+54.3 \\ -15.0}$ | $29.5^{+17.5}_{-6.3}$           | $43.2\substack{+50.7 \\ -12.2}$ | $27.6^{+13.0}_{-10.9}$          | $-0.03\substack{+0.44\\-0.36}$  | $4.77^{+3.70}_{-2.66}$          | $0.75\substack{+0.45 \\ -0.37}$ | $68.3\substack{+52.5\\-14.5}$            | $0.68\substack{+0.16 \\ -0.18}$ | 4200                            | $8.1\substack{+0.4\\-0.7}$    |
| $GW190910_{-}112807$     | $78.7\substack{+9.5 \\ -9.0}$   | $33.9\substack{+4.3\\-3.9}$     | $43.5\substack{+7.6 \\ -6.2}$   | $35.1\substack{+6.3 \\ -7.0}$   | $0.02\substack{+0.19 \\ -0.18}$ | $1.57\substack{+1.07 \\ -0.64}$ | $0.29\substack{+0.17\\-0.11}$   | $75.0\substack{+8.7 \\ -8.5}$            | $0.70\substack{+0.08 \\ -0.07}$ | 10000                           | $14.1\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.3}$ |
| $GW190915\_235702$       | $59.5\substack{+7.5 \\ -6.2}$   | $25.1\substack{+3.1 \\ -2.6}$   | $34.9\substack{+9.5 \\ -6.2}$   | $24.4\substack{+5.5 \\ -6.0}$   | $0.03\substack{+0.19\\-0.24}$   | $1.70\substack{+0.71 \\ -0.64}$ | $0.32\substack{+0.11\\-0.11}$   | $56.8\substack{+7.1 \\ -5.8}$            | $0.71\substack{+0.09\\-0.11}$   | 380                             | $13.6\substack{+0.2\\-0.3}$   |
| $GW190924_021846$        | $13.9\substack{+5.1 \\ -0.9}$   | $5.8\substack{+0.2 \\ -0.2}$    | $8.8\substack{+7.0 \\ -2.0}$    | $5.0^{+1.3}_{-1.9}$             | $0.03\substack{+0.30 \\ -0.09}$ | $0.57\substack{+0.22 \\ -0.22}$ | $0.12\substack{+0.04 \\ -0.04}$ | $13.3\substack{+5.2 \\ -1.0}$            | $0.67\substack{+0.05 \\ -0.05}$ | 380                             | $11.5\substack{+0.3 \\ -0.4}$ |
| $GW190929\_012149$       | $90.6\substack{+21.2\\-14.1}$   | $34.3^{+8.6}_{-6.5}$            | $64.7\substack{+22.4\\-18.9}$   | $25.7^{+14.4}_{-9.7}$           | $0.03\substack{+0.27\\-0.27}$   | $3.68^{+2.98}_{-1.68}$          | $0.61\substack{+0.38 \\ -0.24}$ | $87.5\substack{+20.7\\-14.1}$            | $0.64\substack{+0.17\\-0.23}$   | 1800                            | $9.8\substack{+0.8\\-0.6}$    |
| GW190930_133541          | $20.3^{+9.0}_{-1.5}$            | $8.5^{+0.5}_{-0.5}$             | $12.3^{+12.5}_{-2.3}$           | $7.8^{+1.7}_{-3.3}$             | $0.14\substack{+0.31\\-0.15}$   | $0.78^{+0.37}_{-0.33}$          | $0.16\substack{+0.07\\-0.06}$   | $19.3^{+9.3}_{-1.5}$                     | $0.72\substack{+0.07\\-0.06}$   | 1800                            | $9.5^{+0.3}_{-0.5}$           |



# O3a (2019/4/1 - 2019/9/30)









| Parameter <sup>a</sup>           | EOBNR PHM                     | Phenom PHM                      | Combined                        |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| $m_1/M_{\odot}$                  | $31.7^{+3.6}_{-3.5}$          | $28.1^{+4.8}_{-4.3}$            | $30.1^{+4.6}_{-5.3}$            |
| $m_2/M_{\odot}$                  | $8.0^{+0.9}_{-0.7}$           | $8.8^{+1.5}_{-1.1}$             | $8.3^{+1.6}_{-0.9}$             |
| $M/M_{\odot}$                    | $39.7^{+3.0}_{-2.8}$          | $36.9^{+3.7}_{-2.9}$            | $38.4^{+3.8}_{-3.9}$            |
| $\mathcal{M}/M_{\odot}$          | $13.3^{+0.3}_{-0.3}$          | $13.2_{-0.3}^{+0.5}$            | $13.3_{-0.4}^{+0.4}$            |
| q                                | $0.25\substack{+0.06\\-0.04}$ | $0.31\substack{+0.12\\-0.07}$   | $0.28\substack{+0.12 \\ -0.07}$ |
| $M_{\rm f}/M_{\odot}$            | $38.6^{+3.1}_{-2.8}$          | $35.7^{+3.8}_{-3.0}$            | $37.3_{-4.0}^{+3.8}$            |
| χf                               | $0.68\substack{+0.04\\-0.04}$ | $0.67\substack{+0.07 \\ -0.07}$ | $0.67\substack{+0.06\\-0.05}$   |
| $m_1^{ m det}/M_{\odot}$         | $36.5^{+4.2}_{-4.2}$          | $32.3^{+5.7}_{-5.2}$            | $34.6^{+5.4}_{-6.4}$            |
| $m_2^{\rm det}/M_{\odot}$        | $9.2^{+0.9}_{-0.7}$           | $10.1^{+1.6}_{-1.2}$            | $9.6^{+1.7}_{-1.0}$             |
| $M^{ m det}/M_{\odot}$           | $45.7^{+3.5}_{-3.3}$          | $42.5_{-3.7}^{+4.4}$            | $44.2_{-4.7}^{+4.4}$            |
| $\mathcal{M}^{ m det}/M_{\odot}$ | $15.3_{-0.2}^{+0.1}$          | $15.2_{-0.2}^{+0.3}$            | $15.2_{-0.1}^{+0.3}$            |
| χeff                             | $0.28\substack{+0.06\\-0.08}$ | $0.22^{+0.08}_{-0.11}$          | $0.25^{+0.08}_{-0.11}$          |
| χ <sub>p</sub>                   | $0.31_{-0.15}^{+0.14}$        | $0.31_{-0.17}^{+0.24}$          | $0.31^{+0.19}_{-0.16}$          |
| χ1                               | $0.46_{-0.15}^{+0.12}$        | $0.41^{+0.22}_{-0.24}$          | $0.44^{+0.16}_{-0.22}$          |
| $D_{\rm L}/{\rm Mpc}$            | $740^{+120}_{-130}$           | $740^{+150}_{-190}$             | $740^{+130}_{-160}$             |
| z                                | $0.15_{-0.02}^{+0.02}$        | $0.15_{-0.04}^{+0.03}$          | $0.15^{+0.03}_{-0.03}$          |
| $\hat{	heta}_{JN}$               | $0.71^{+0.23}_{-0.21}$        | $0.71\substack{+0.39\\-0.27}$   | $0.71\substack{+0.31\\-0.24}$   |
| $\rho_{\rm H}$                   | $9.5^{+0.1}_{-0.2}$           | $9.5_{-0.3}^{+0.2}$             | $9.5^{+0.1}_{-0.3}$             |
| $ ho_{ m L}$                     | $16.2_{-0.2}^{+0.1}$          | $16.1_{-0.3}^{+0.2}$            | $16.2^{+0.1}_{-0.3}$            |
| $ ho_{ m V}$                     | $3.7^{+0.2}_{-0.5}$           | $3.6^{+0.3}_{-1.0}$             | $3.6^{+0.3}_{-0.7}$             |
| $\rho_{ m HLV}$                  | $19.1\substack{+0.2\\-0.2}$   | $19.0\substack{+0.2\\-0.3}$     | $19.1\substack{+0.1\\-0.3}$     |

TABLE II. Inferred parameter values for GW190412 and their 90% credible intervals, obtained using precessing models including higher multipoles.

# **GW190412 : asymmetric masses**

| mass     | 30.1 <sup>+4.6</sup> -5.3 M |
|----------|-----------------------------|
| distance | 740 $^{+130}$ -160 N        |

# waveform with modulation



FIG. 9. Reconstructions of the gravitational waveform of GW190412 in the LIGO Hanford, LIGO Livingston and Virgo detectors (from left to right). We show detector data, whitened by an inverse amplitude-spectral-density filter computed using BayesLine [105], together with the unmodeled BayesWave reconstruction that uses a wavelet bases, and the reconstruction based on the precessing, higher multipole models from the EOBNR and Phenom families. The bands indicate the 90% credible intervals at each time. We caution that some apparent amplitude fluctuations in this figure are an artifact of the whitening procedure.

# $I_{sun} + 8.3 + 1.6_{-0.9} M_{sun} -> 37.3 + 3.8_{-4.0} M_{sun}$ Apc, z = 0.15 + 0.03 - 0.03

m=3 modes are visible!



FIG. 8. Top panel: Time-frequency spectrogram of data containing GW190412, observed in the LIGO Livingston detector. The horizontal axis is time (in seconds) relative to the trigger time (1239082262.17). The amplitude scale of the detector output is normalized by the PSD of the noise. To illustrate the method, the predicted track for the m = 3 multipoles is highlighted as a dashed line, above the track from the m = 2 multipoles that are visible in the spectrogram. Bottom panel: The variation of  $Y(\alpha)$ , i.e., the energy in the pixels of the top panel, along the track defined by  $f_{\alpha}(t) = \alpha f_{22}(t)$ , where  $f_{22}(t)$  is computed from the Phenom HM analysis. Two consecutive peaks at  $\alpha = 1.0$  and  $\alpha = 1.5$  (thin dashed line) indicate the energy of the m = 2 and m = 3 multipoles, respectively. Inset: The distribution of the detection statistic  $\beta$  in noise, used to quantify *p*-values for the hypothesis that the data contains m = 2 and m = 3 multipoles (red dashed line). 14



[Hz]

Frequ

# **GW190521**



Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06







# GW190521







### Astrophysics > High Energy Astrophysical Phenomena

[Submitted on 14 Jan 2021]

### Alternative possibility of GW190521: Gravitational waves from high-mass black hole-disk systems

Masaru Shibata, Kenta Kiuchi, Sho Fujibayashi, Yuichiro Sekiguchi

We evolve high-mass disks of mass  $15 - 50M_{\odot}$  orbiting a  $50M_{\odot}$  spinning black hole in the framework of numerical relativity. Such high-mass systems could be an outcome during the collapse of rapidly-rotating very-massive stars. The massive disks are dynamically unstable to the so-called one-armed spiral-shape deformation with the maximum fractional density-perturbation of  $\delta\rho/\rho \gtrsim 0.1$ , and hence, high-amplitude gravitational waves are emitted. The waveforms are characterized by an initial high-amplitude burst with the frequency of  $\sim 40 - 50$  Hz and the maximum amplitude of  $(1 - 10) \times 10^{-22}$  at the hypothetical distance of 100 Mpc and by a subsequent low-amplitude quasi-periodic oscillation. We illustrate that the waveforms in our models with a wide range of the disk mass resemble that of GW190521. We also point out that gravitational-wave detectors for exploring the formation process of rapidly-rotating high-mass black holes of mass  $\sim 50 - 100M_{\odot}$  in an early universe.



### $50 M_{sun} BH + 30 M_{sun} Disk$

# GW190521







# GW190814 : 23M + 2.6M

### $23.2 + 1.1 - 1.0 M_{sun} + 2.59 + 0.08 - 0.09 M_{sun} - > 25.6 + 1.1 - 0.9 M_{sun}$ mass 241 +41-45 Mpc, z = 0.053 + 0.009 - 0.010distance

Source Properties of GW190814: We Report the Median Values Along with the Symmetric 90% Credible Intervals for the SEOBNRV4PHM (EOBNR PHM) and IMRPHENOMPV3HM (PHENOM PHM) Waveform Models

|   | EOBNR PHM                        | Phenom PHM                        | Combined                          |
|---|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Primary mass $m_1/M_{\odot}$                            | $23.2^{+1.0}_{-0.9}$             | $23.2^{+1.3}_{-1.1}$              | $23.2^{+1.1}_{-1.0}$              |
| Secondary mass $m_2/M_{\odot}$                          | $2.59\substack{+0.08\\-0.08}$    | $2.58\substack{+0.09\\-0.10}$     | $2.59_{-0.09}^{+0.08}$            |
| Mass ratio q  | $0.112\substack{+0.008\\-0.008}$ | $0.111\substack{+0.009\\-0.010}$  | $0.112\substack{+0.008\\-0.009}$  |
| Chirp mass $\mathcal{M}/M_{\odot}$                      | $6.10\substack{+0.06\\-0.05}$    | $6.08\substack{+0.06\\-0.05}$     | $6.09\substack{+0.06\\-0.06}$     |
| Total mass $M/M_{\odot}$                                | $25.8^{+0.9}_{-0.8}$             | $25.8^{+1.2}_{-1.0}$              | $25.8^{+1.0}_{-0.9}$              |
| Final mass $M_{\rm f}/M_{\odot}$                        | $25.6^{+1.0}_{-0.8}$             | $25.5^{+1.2}_{-1.0}$              | $25.6^{+1.1}_{-0.9}$              |
| Upper bound on primary spin magnitude $\chi_1$          | 0.06                             | 0.08                              | 0.07                              |
| Effective inspiral spin parameter $\chi_{\rm eff}$      | $0.001\substack{+0.059\\-0.056}$ | $-0.005\substack{+0.061\\-0.065}$ | $-0.002\substack{+0.060\\-0.061}$ |
| Upper bound on effective precession parameter $\chi_p$  | 0.07                             | 0.07                              | 0.07                              |
| Final spin $\chi_{\rm f}$                               | $0.28\substack{+0.02\\-0.02}$    | $0.28\substack{+0.02\\-0.03}$     | $0.28\substack{+0.02\\-0.02}$     |
| Luminosity distance $D_{\rm L}/{\rm Mpc}$               | $235_{-45}^{+40}$                | $249^{+39}_{-43}$                 | $241_{-45}^{+41}$                 |
| Source redshift z                                       | $0.051\substack{+0.008\\-0.009}$ | $0.054\substack{+0.008\\-0.009}$  | $0.053\substack{+0.009\\-0.010}$  |
| Inclination angle $\Theta$ /rad                         | $0.9^{+0.3}_{-0.2}$              | $0.8^{+0.2}_{-0.2}$               | $0.8^{+0.3}_{-0.2}$               |
| Signal-to-noise ratio in LIGO Hanford $\rho_{\rm H}$    | $10.6^{+0.1}_{-0.1}$             | $10.7^{+0.1}_{-0.2}$              | $10.7_{-0.2}^{+0.1}$              |
| Signal-to-noise ratio in LIGO Livingston $\rho_{\rm L}$ | $22.21^{+0.09}_{-0.15}$          | $22.16\substack{+0.09\\-0.17}$    | $22.18_{-0.17}^{+0.10}$           |
| Signal-to-noise ratio in Virgo $\rho_{\rm V}$           | $4.3^{+0.2}_{-0.5}$              | $4.1^{+0.2}_{-0.6}$               | $4.2^{+0.2}_{-0.6}$               |
| Network Signal-to-noise ratio $\rho_{\rm HLV}$          | $25.0^{+0.1}_{-0.2}$             | $24.9^{+0.1}_{-0.2}$              | $25.0^{+0.1}_{-0.2}$              |

Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

mass ratio q=0.11





Figure 6. Two-dimensional posterior probability for the tilt-angle and spinmagnitude for the primary object (left) and secondary object (right) based on the combined samples. The tilt angles are 0° for spins aligned and 180° for spins antialigned with the orbital angular momentum. The tiles are constructed linearly in spin magnitude and the cosine of the tilt angles such that each tile contains identical prior probability. The color indicates the posterior probability per pixel. The probabilities are marginalized over the azimuthal angles.

secondary component is either the lightest BH or the heaviest NS

LIGO/Virgo

ApJL 896 (2020) L44





Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

# LIGO/Virgo

# **GWTC-2** properties

## arXiv:2010.14533







# **GW** search near **GRB** events

In O3a, Fermi/Swift detected  $\sim$ 150 GRB short GRB (ms--s) : NSNS, NSBH (likely for GW170817) ► Modeled Search for 32 GRBs long GRB (s--min) : SN? Generic Burst Search for 105 GRBs

# no GW detection

distance to GRB source ?

should be away than LIGO-Virgo Obs distance



### Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06



If GRB190610A is NSNS, the distance is over 63 Mpc.

Near the source region, there is a galaxy at 165 Mpc. Consistent.

# LIGO/Virgo

arXiv:2010.14550







# No "mountains" in msec-pulsars

## O1+O2+O3a data, GW emission from 5 known pulsars.

| Pulsar            | $f_{ m rot} \  m (Hz)$ | $\dot{f}_{ m rot} \ ({ m Hzs^{-1}})$ | $\dot{f}_{ m rot}^{ m int} \ ({ m Hzs^{-1}})$ | distance<br>(kpc)            | lu |  |  |  |
|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|------------------------------|----|--|--|--|
| Young pulsars     |                        |                                      |   |                              |    |  |  |  |
| J0534+2200 (Crab) | 29.6                   | $-3.7 	imes 10^{-10}$                |   | $2.0\pm0.5^{^a}$             |    |  |  |  |
| J0835-4510 (Vela) | 11.2                   | $-2.8 	imes 10^{-11^{b}}$            |   | $0.287^{+0.019c}_{-0.017}$   |    |  |  |  |
|                   | Recycled pulsars       |                                      |   |                              |    |  |  |  |
| J0437 - 4715      | 173.7                  | $-1.7 \times 10^{-15}$               | $-4.1 \times 10^{-16}$                        | $0.15679 \pm 0.00025^{^{d}}$ |    |  |  |  |
| J0711 - 6830      | 182.1                  | $-4.9 \times 10^{-16}$               | $-4.7 \times 10^{-16}$                        | $0.110 \pm 0.044^{^{e}}$     |    |  |  |  |
| J0737-3039A       | 44.1                   | $-3.4 \times 10^{-15}$               |   | $1.15^{+0.22f}_{-0.16}$      |    |  |  |  |



Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

LIGO/Virgo ApJL 902 (2020) L21 (arXiv:2007.14251)



X-ray Pulsar PSR J0537-6910 @ 160k lyr

= known as the best energy emitter (the maximum spin-down brightness) and also has frequent glitches



(GW from asymmetry of NS) n=5

(GW via Surface Wave) n=7

Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

# **Pulsar J0537-6910**

no mountains in its equator, mountain < several 10 cm GW emission is less than 14 % of spin-down energy



# **Upper limits on Isotropic GW background**

### Gating

Large population of **loud glitches** in LIGO-H and LIGO-L leads to **removal of >50%** of coincident lifetime due to non-stationary cut. Gating zeroes out these glitches with only introducing a **deadtime of < 1%**. Gating has **no impact** on our ability to **recover a GWB**.



### Magnetic noise budget

Global coherent magnetic fields can mimic a GWB. This effect is studied by using precise measurements of the magnetic fields at the sites and the coupling of magnetic fields to the interferometers



Magnetic noise (Schumann resonance) is less than the sensitivity

LIGO-Virgo-KAGRA

arXiv:2101.12130

data quality improvement by "Gating" technique



- Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06



# webinar slide Feb 5, 2021



# **Upper limits on Isotropic GW background**

### **Cross-correlation spectra + parameter estimation formalism**



- H, L and V baselines combined *for* the first time!
- O3 data consistent with uncorrelated, Gaussian noise

• We fit models to O3 data using a hybrid frequentist-Bayesian approach:

$$p(\hat{C}_k^{IJ}|\boldsymbol{\Theta}) \propto \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2}\sum_{IJ}\sum_k \left(\frac{\hat{C}_k^{IJ} - \Omega_{\rm M}(f_k|\boldsymbol{\Theta})}{\sigma_{IJ}(f_k)}\right)^2\right]$$

- Models we consider:
  - 1. Power Law (PL)
  - 2. Scalar-Vector-Tensor PL (SVT-PL)
  - 3. Magnetic (MAG)
  - 4. Compact binary coalescence (CBC)

f (Hz)

Callister et al, Phys. Rev. X 7, 041058

# Upper limits (ULs) on PL backgrounds

Two parameters in the PL model:

$$\Omega_{\mathrm{PL}}(f)$$
 =

We place ULs on  $\Omega_{ref}$  for different priors:

| v <u>i</u> | Log-uniform prior    |                      |             |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| $\alpha$   | O3                   | O2                   | Improvement |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 0          | $5.8 \times 10^{-9}$ | $3.5 \times 10^{-8}$ | 6.0         |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2/3        | $3.4 \times 10^{-9}$ | $3.0 \times 10^{-8}$ | 8.8         |  |  |  |  |  |  |

### Upper limits non-GR backgrounds

$$\Omega_{\rm SVT-PL}(f) = \sum_{\rm p} \beta_{IJ}^{\rm (p)}(f) \Omega_{\rm ref}^{\rm (p)} \left(\frac{f}{f_{\rm ref}}\right)^{\alpha_{\rm r}}$$

### $\beta_{IJ}^{(p)}(f) = \gamma_{IJ}^{(p)}(f) / \gamma_{IJ}(f)$

For a log-uniform prior on all  $\Omega$ ref and a marginalized prior on all  $\alpha$ ,

| Polarization | O3                   | 02                   | Improvement |
|--------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------------|
| Tensor       | $6.4 \times 10^{-9}$ | $3.2 \times 10^{-8}$ | 5.0         |
| Vector       | $7.9 \times 10^{-9}$ | $2.9 \times 10^{-8}$ | 3.7         |
| Scalar       | $2.1 \times 10^{-8}$ | $6.1 \times 10^{-8}$ | 2.9         |

### ▲ upper limits on scalar, vector modes

 $= \Omega_{\mathrm{ref}} \left( \frac{f}{f_{\mathrm{ref}}} \right)^{lpha}$ 



# ▲ upper limits on Power-Low models

## Joint Magnetic + GWB fit

- A *novel approach*, complementary to the
  - magnetic noise budget
- We model the background from the local magnetic field
- We model its coupling to the strain channel of the detectors, the transfer function

$$|T_I(f)| = \kappa_I \left(\frac{f}{10 \text{ Hz}}\right)^-$$

- Gaussian noise preferred over correlated magnetic noise:
- Gaussian noise preferred over correlated magnetic noise + power law GWB:



$$\log_{10}\mathcal{B}_{\mathrm{N}}^{\mathrm{MAG}} = -0.03$$

# $\log_{10}\mathcal{B}_{\mathrm{N}}^{\mathrm{MAG+PL}} = -0.3$

webinar slide

### Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

# LIGO-Virgo-KAGRA

### arXiv:2101.12130

# 01+02+03 data (O3 with Virgo)

# no GWB detection





# Feb 5, 2021



# **Constraints on Cosmic Strings**



## **Cosmic strings: stochastic search**



*Model B*: Lorenz, Ringeval, Sakellariadou, JCAP 1010, 003 (2010)



# LIGO-Virgo-KAGRA

## arXiv:2101.12248

## **Cosmic strings: overview and burst search**

Three different (sets of) models for the population of cosmic string loops

- Model A: Blanco-Pillado et al., PhysRevD.89.023512
- Model B: Lorenz et al., JCAP 10 (2010) 003
- Model(s) C: new set of models that extends both models A and B Auclair et al., JCAP 06 (2019) 015

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}R_i}{\ell\mathrm{d}V} = \frac{2}{\ell}N_i \times n(\ell, t) \times \Delta_i \times (1+z)^{-1}$$

 $R = \int \mathrm{d}A\varepsilon(A) \frac{\mathrm{d}R}{\mathrm{d}A}(A, G\mu, N_k)$ 

Bursts are assumed to follow Poissonian statistics

$$P(X=k)=rac{\lambda^k}{k!}\mathrm{e}^{-\lambda}, \quad \lambda=T_{\mathrm{obs}}\mathcal{R}$$

Parameters that are not consistent with the non-detection of bursts are excluded

$$P(X=0)=\mathrm{e}^{-T_{\mathrm{obs}}\mathcal{R}}<5\%$$

$$\mathcal{R} > 2.996/T_{
m obs}$$

webinar slide Feb 5, 2021





JCAP 06, 015 (2019)





Test of GR

# **Test of Gravity Theories**







### Test of GR

# **GWTC-2: Test of General Relativity by LIGO-Virgo**

## 1. Residuals test



Subtract the best fit template for the event from the strain data and compute the 90% upper limit on residual SNR.

Check whether the residual SNR is consistent with SNR from noise: measure SNR from noise-only times around the event times, yielding a p-value

$$p = P(SNR_{noise}^{90\%} \ge SNR_{residual}^{90\%})$$

# LIGO/Virgo

### arXiv:2010.14529

TABLE III. Results of the residuals analysis (Sec. IV A). For each event, we present the SNR of the subtracted GR waveform (SNRGR), the 90%-credible upper limit on the residual network SNR (SNR<sub>90</sub>), a corresponding lower limit on the fitting factor (FF<sub>90</sub>), and the *p*-value.

| Events          | SNR <sub>GR</sub> | Residual SNR <sub>90</sub> | FF90 | p-value |
|-----------------|-------------------|----------------------------|------|---------|
| GW190408-181802 | 16.06             | 8.48                       | 0.88 | 0.15    |
| GW190412        | 18.23             | 6.67                       | 0.94 | 0.30    |
| GW190421_213856 | 10.47             | 7.52                       | 0.81 | 0.07    |
| GW190503_185404 | 13.21             | 5.78                       | 0.92 | 0.83    |
| GW190512_180714 | 12.81             | 5.92                       | 0.91 | 0.44    |
| GW190513_205428 | 12.85             | 6.44                       | 0.89 | 0.70    |
| GW190517_055101 | 11.52             | 6.40                       | 0.87 | 0.69    |
| GW190519_153544 | 15.34             | 6.38                       | 0.92 | 0.65    |
| GW190521        | 14.23             | 6.34                       | 0.91 | 0.28    |
| GW190521_074359 | 25.71             | 6.15                       | 0.97 | 0.35    |
| GW190602_175927 | 13.22             | 5.46                       | 0.92 | 0.86    |
| GW190630_185205 | 16.13             | 5.13                       | 0.95 | 0.52    |
| GW190706_222641 | 13.39             | 7.80                       | 0.86 | 0.18    |
| GW190707_093326 | 13.55             | 5.89                       | 0.92 | 0.25    |
| GW190708_232457 | 13.97             | 6.00                       | 0.92 | 0.19    |
| GW190720_000836 | 10.56             | 7.30                       | 0.82 | 0.18    |
| GW190727_060333 | 11.62             | 4.88                       | 0.92 | 0.97    |
| GW190728_064510 | 13.47             | 5.98                       | 0.91 | 0.53    |
| GW190814        | 25.06             | 6.43                       | 0.97 | 0.84    |
| GW190828_063405 | 16.13             | 8.47                       | 0.89 | 0.12    |
| GW190828_065509 | 9.67              | 6.30                       | 0.84 | 0.41    |
| GW190910_112807 | 14.32             | 5.60                       | 0.93 | 0.65    |
| GW190915_235702 | 13.82             | 8.30                       | 0.86 | 0.09    |
| GW190924_021846 | 12.21             | 5.91                       | 0.90 | 0.57    |
|                 |                   |                            |      |         |

noise)

All p-values consistent with residual SNR produced by noise

No statistically significant deviations from GR

Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06



# 1. Residuals test

# 2. Inspiral-merger-ringdown consistency test



Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06



Waveform models

IMRPhenom - phenomenological PN-based models, calibrated to NR SEOB - aligned-spin effective-one-body models, calibrated to NR (note: only includes quadrupole)

## IMRPhenom waveform test mostly consistent, but …

◀ 39.5M+29.5M, SNR@ inspiral < 8</p> GW170823 GW190408 181802 4 24.5M+18.3M, with multimodal posterior GW190814 ◀ 23M+2.6M, large mass ratio ever

# No statistically significant deviations from GR



### Test of GR

# **GWTC-2: Test of General Relativity by LIGO-Virgo**

- 1. Residuals test
- 2. IMR consistency test
- 3. Hierarchical analysis
- 4. Parametrized test

$$\tilde{h}(f) = A(f) e^{i \varphi(f)}$$



 $\eta=m_1m_2/M^2$ 

Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

# LIGO/Virgo

### arXiv:2010.14529

$$\varphi_{\text{inspiral}}(f) = \varphi_{\text{ref}} + 2\pi f t_{\text{ref}} + \varphi_{\text{Newton}}(Mf)^{-5/3} + \varphi_{0.5\text{PN}}(Mf)^{-1} + \varphi_{1.5\text{PN}}(Mf)^{-2/3} + \cdots$$

 $\{\delta arphi_{-2}, \delta arphi_0, \delta arphi_1, \cdots, \delta arphi_7\} \propto f^{(i-5)/3}$ 

$$\varphi_{\text{intermediate}}(f) = \eta^{-1} \left( \beta_0 + \beta_1 f + \beta_2 \log f - \frac{\beta_3}{3} f^{-3} \right)$$
$$\varphi_{\text{MR}}(f) = \eta^{-1} \left\{ \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 f - \alpha_2 f^{-1} + \frac{4}{3} \alpha_3 f^{3/4} + \alpha_4 \tan^{-1} \left( \frac{f - \alpha_3}{f_{\text{dar}}} \right) \right\}$$









ZJ

### Test of GR

# **GWTC-2: Test of General Relativity by LIGO-Virgo**

1. Residuals test 2. IMR consistency test 3. Hierarchical analysis 4. Parametrized test 5. Spin-induced quadrupol 6. Ringdown 7. Echoes 8. Dispersion 9. Polarizations

$$h_{+}(t) - ih_{\times}(t) = \sum_{\ell=2}^{+\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} \sum_{n=0}^{+\infty} \mathcal{A}_{\ell m n} \exp\left[-\frac{t - t_{0}}{(1+z)\tau_{\ell m n}}\right] \exp\left[\frac{2\pi i f_{\ell m n}(t-t_{0})}{1+z}\right]_{-2} S_{\ell m n}(\theta,\phi,\chi)$$

| Event           |                         | Redshifted $(1 + z)$                           | d final mass $M_{\rm f}$ [M <sub>o</sub> ] | S                              |                        | Fina                   | l spin                 |                        | Higher<br>modes                            | Ove                                 | rtones            |
|-----------------|-------------------------|--|--|--------------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|--|-------------------------------------|-------------------|
|                 | IMR                     | Kerr <sub>220</sub>                            | Kerr <sub>221</sub>                        | Kerr <sub>HM</sub>             | IMR                    | Kerr <sub>220</sub>    | Kerr <sub>221</sub>    | Kerr <sub>HM</sub>     | $\log_{10}\mathcal{B}_{220}^{\mathrm{HM}}$ | $\log_{10} \mathcal{B}_{220}^{221}$ | $\log_{10} O_0^r$ |
| GW150914        | $68.8^{+3.6}_{-3.1}$    | $62.7^{+19.0}_{-12.1}$                         | $71.7^{+13.2}_{-12.5}$                     | 80.3 <sup>+20.1</sup><br>-21.7 | $0.69^{+0.05}_{-0.04}$ | $0.52^{+0.33}_{-0.44}$ | $0.69^{+0.18}_{-0.36}$ | $0.83^{+0.13}_{-0.45}$ | 0.03                                       | 0.63                                | -                 |
| GW170104        | $58.5^{+4.6}_{-4.1}$    | $56.2^{+19.1}_{-11.6}$                         | $61.3^{+16.7}_{-13.2}$                     | $104.3^{+207.7}_{-43.1}$       | $0.66^{+0.08}_{-0.11}$ | $0.26^{+0.42}_{-0.24}$ | $0.51_{-0.44}^{+0.34}$ | $0.59^{+0.34}_{-0.51}$ | 0.26                                       | -0.20                               | -                 |
| GW170814        | $59.7^{+3.0}_{-2.3}$    | $46.1^{+133.0}_{-33.6}$                        | $56.6^{+20.9}_{-11.1}$                     | $171.2^{+268.7}_{-143.5}$      | $0.72^{+0.07}_{-0.05}$ | $0.52_{-0.47}^{+0.42}$ | $0.47^{+0.40}_{-0.42}$ | $0.54_{-0.48}^{+0.41}$ | 0.04                                       | -0.19                               | -                 |
| GW170823        | $88.8^{+11.2}_{-10.2}$  | $73.8^{+26.8}_{-23.7}$                         | $79.0^{+21.3}_{-13.2}$                     | $103.0^{+133.1}_{-46.7}$       | $0.72^{+0.09}_{-0.12}$ | $0.46^{+0.40}_{-0.41}$ | $0.36^{+0.38}_{-0.32}$ | $0.74_{-0.61}^{+0.22}$ | 0.02                                       | -0.98                               | -                 |
| GW190408_181802 | $53.1^{+3.2}_{-3.4}$    | $22.4_{-11.1}^{+253.0}$                        | $46.6^{+18.8}_{-10.9}$                     | $127.4^{+327.7}_{-107.6}$      | $0.67^{+0.06}_{-0.07}$ | $0.45_{-0.40}^{+0.45}$ | $0.36^{+0.46}_{-0.33}$ | $0.46^{+0.47}_{-0.41}$ | -0.05                                      | -1.02                               | -                 |
| GW190512_180714 | $43.4_{-2.8}^{+4.1}$    | $37.6^{+48.9}_{-22.4}$                         | $36.7^{+19.3}_{-24.8}$                     | $99.4_{-66.5}^{+247.6}$        | $0.65^{+0.07}_{-0.07}$ | $0.41_{-0.37}^{+0.47}$ | $0.45^{+0.40}_{-0.39}$ | $0.77^{+0.20}_{-0.66}$ | 0.09                                       | -0.42                               |                   |
| GW190513_205428 | $70.8^{+12.2}_{-6.9}$   | $55.5^{+31.5}_{-42.1}$                         | $68.5^{+28.2}_{-11.8}$                     | $88.7^{+250.0}_{-41.9}$        | $0.69^{+0.14}_{-0.12}$ | $0.38^{+0.48}_{-0.34}$ | $0.31_{-0.28}^{+0.53}$ | $0.59^{+0.34}_{-0.52}$ | 0.09                                       | -0.54                               | -                 |
| GW190519_153544 | $148.2^{+14.5}_{-15.5}$ | $120.7^{+39.7}_{-21.5}$                        | $125.9^{+24.3}_{-21.7}$                    | $155.4^{+84.4}_{-42.5}$        | $0.80^{+0.07}_{-0.12}$ | $0.42^{+0.41}_{-0.36}$ | $0.52^{+0.25}_{-0.40}$ | $0.70^{+0.21}_{-0.50}$ | 0.21                                       | -0.00                               | -                 |
| GW190521        | $259.2^{+36.6}_{-29.0}$ | $282.2^{+50.0}_{-61.9}$                        | $284.0^{+40.4}_{-43.9}$                    | $299.3^{+57.7}_{-62.4}$        | $0.73_{-0.14}^{+0.11}$ | $0.76_{-0.38}^{+0.14}$ | $0.78^{+0.10}_{-0.22}$ | $0.80^{+0.13}_{-0.30}$ | 0.12                                       | -0.86                               | -                 |
| GW190521_074359 | $88.1_{-4.9}^{+4.3}$    | $83.0^{+24.0}_{-17.2}$                         | $86.4^{+14.1}_{-14.8}$                     | $105.9^{+20.8}_{-26.4}$        | $0.72^{+0.05}_{-0.07}$ | $0.57^{+0.31}_{-0.49}$ | $0.67^{+0.17}_{-0.34}$ | $0.87^{+0.09}_{-0.39}$ | -0.04                                      | 1.29                                | -                 |
| GW190602_175927 | $165.6^{+20.5}_{-19.2}$ | $156.4^{+71.4}_{-30.6}$                        | $160.0^{+37.4}_{-31.2}$                    | $261.7^{+84.4}_{-91.5}$        | $0.71^{+0.10}_{-0.13}$ | $0.34_{-0.31}^{+0.41}$ | $0.46^{+0.31}_{-0.39}$ | $0.79^{+0.14}_{-0.49}$ | 0.61                                       | -1.56                               |                   |
| GW190706_222641 | $173.6^{+18.8}_{-22.9}$ | $136.0^{+52.0}_{-29.3}$                        | $152.5^{+37.8}_{-28.4}$                    | $184.0^{+139.2}_{-55.8}$       | $0.80^{+0.08}_{-0.17}$ | $0.41^{+0.42}_{-0.37}$ | $0.55^{+0.31}_{-0.45}$ | $0.68^{+0.26}_{-0.54}$ | -0.06                                      | -0.64                               | -                 |
| GW190708_232457 | $34.4^{+2.7}_{-0.7}$    | $28.9^{+285.4}_{-17.9}$                        | $32.3^{+15.0}_{-12.2}$                     | $171.9^{+307.6}_{-147.8}$      | $0.69^{+0.04}_{-0.04}$ | $0.47^{+0.45}_{-0.42}$ | $0.34_{-0.31}^{+0.44}$ | $0.43^{+0.51}_{-0.39}$ | -0.11                                      | -0.17                               | -                 |
| GW190727_060333 | $100.0^{+10.5}_{-10.0}$ | $78.7^{+45.7}_{-66.4}$                         | $88.8^{+25.7}_{-16.0}$                     | $107.4^{+112.1}_{-42.7}$       | $0.73^{+0.10}_{-0.10}$ | $0.53^{+0.42}_{-0.47}$ | $0.45^{+0.39}_{-0.41}$ | $0.71^{+0.24}_{-0.59}$ | -0.02                                      | -1.65                               | -                 |
| GW190828_063405 | $75.9^{+6.0}_{-5.2}$    | $71.2^{+35.8}_{-55.5}$                         | $69.6^{+22.0}_{-17.3}$                     | $99.0^{+166.0}_{-49.1}$        | $0.76^{+0.06}_{-0.07}$ | $0.72^{+0.25}_{-0.62}$ | $0.65^{+0.27}_{-0.55}$ | $0.92^{+0.06}_{-0.74}$ | 0.05                                       | -0.72                               | -                 |
| GW190910_112807 | $97.3^{+9.4}_{-7.1}$    | $112.2^{+32.0}_{-31.7}$                        | $107.7^{+28.6}_{-27.4}$                    | $137.1_{-31.4}^{+59.5}$        | $0.70^{+0.08}_{-0.07}$ | $0.76^{+0.18}_{-0.55}$ | $0.75^{+0.17}_{-0.46}$ | $0.91^{+0.07}_{-0.27}$ | -0.10                                      | -0.64                               | -                 |
| GW190915_235702 | $75.0^{+7.7}_{-7.3}$    | <b>38.3</b> <sup>+335.1</sup> <sub>-27.4</sub> | $63.0^{+19.1}_{-9.9}$                      | $137.3^{+324.1}_{-96.2}$       | $0.71^{+0.09}_{-0.11}$ | $0.52^{+0.43}_{-0.46}$ | $0.27^{+0.40}_{-0.24}$ | $0.55^{+0.39}_{-0.49}$ | 0.06                                       | -0.37                               | -                 |

# LIGO/Virgo

arXiv:2010.14529

No significant evidence for higher-mode in ringdown part

Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06







# \* BH Spectroscopy with coherent mode stacking

week ending PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 123, 121101 (2019) PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 21 APRIL 2017 PRL 118, 161101 (2017) **Black Hole Spectroscopy with Coherent Mode Stacking** Hierarchical Test of General Relativity with Gravitational Waves Huan Yang,<sup>1</sup> Kent Yagi,<sup>1</sup> Jonathan Blackman,<sup>2</sup> Luis Lehner,<sup>3,4</sup> Vasileios Paschalidis,<sup>1</sup> Frans Pretorius,<sup>1,4</sup> and Nicolás Yunes<sup>5</sup> Maximiliano Isi<sup>(0)</sup>,<sup>1,2,\*</sup> Katerina Chatziioannou,<sup>1,†</sup> and Will M. Farr<sup>1,3,‡</sup> <sup>1</sup>Department of Physics, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey 08544, USA <sup>1</sup>Center for Computational Astrophysics, Flatiron Institute, 162 5th Ave, New York, New York 10010, USA <sup>2</sup>TAPIR, Walter Burke Institute for Theoretical Physics, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, California 91125, USA <sup>2</sup>LIGO Laboratory and Kavli Institute for Astrophysics and Space Research, <sup>3</sup>Perimeter Institute for Theoretical Physics, Waterloo, Ontario N2L 2Y5, Canada Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02139, USA <sup>4</sup>CIFAR, Cosmology and Gravity Program, Toronto, Ontario M5G 1Z8, Canada <sup>3</sup>Department of Physics and Astronomy, Stony Brook University, Stony Brook, New York 11794, USA <sup>5</sup>eXtreme Gravity Institute, Department of Physics, Montana State University, Bozeman, Montana 59717, USA (Received 5 May 2019; published 16 September 2019) (Received 20 January 2017; published 20 April 2017)

# \* "parametrized ringdown spin expansion coefficients" (ParSpec)

PHYSICAL REVIEW D 101, 024043 (2020)

### Parametrized ringdown spin expansion coefficients: A data-analysis framework for black-hole spectroscopy with multiple events

Andrea Maselli<sup>(0)</sup>,<sup>1</sup> Paolo Pani<sup>(0)</sup>,<sup>1</sup> Leonardo Gualtieri,<sup>1</sup> and Emanuele Berti<sup>(0)</sup> <sup>1</sup>Dipartimento di Fisica, "Sapienza" Università di Roma, Piazzale Aldo Moro 5, 00185, Roma, Italy <sup>2</sup>Department of Physics and Astronomy, John Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland 21218, USA

(Received 31 October 2019; published 22 January 2020)

Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

# **Statistical Approaches**

# \* Hierarchical Test



# **BH** Spectroscopy with coherent mode stacking

SNR of GW150914 ringdown  $\sim 7$ higher modes can be seen SNR  $\sim$  45

\* Ringdown part = (2,2) + (3,3) modes

 $s_j = n_j + h_{22,j} + h_{33,j}, \qquad h_{\ell m,j}(t) = A_{\ell m,j} e^{-\gamma_{\ell m,j} t} \sin(\omega_{\ell m,j} t - \phi_{\ell m,j})$ 

\* Pick up one event  $(i^{th})$  as the base case. Rescale (3,3) freq. equal to all events.

> secondary mode phase offset  $\phi_{33,i} \equiv \phi_{33}$  and frequency  $\omega_{33,i} \equiv \omega_{33}$ . Specifically, we scale and shift each signal in time via  $\mathbf{s}_{j}(t) \equiv s_{j}(t/\alpha_{j} + \Delta_{j})$ , with  $\alpha_{j} \equiv \omega_{33,j}/\omega_{33}$ and  $\Delta_{j} \equiv (\phi_{33,j} - \phi_{33})/\omega_{33,j}$ .

\* Sum up all events in freq mode

$$\tilde{\mathbf{s}}_{j}(f) \equiv \alpha_{j} e^{i\omega\Delta_{j}\alpha_{j}} \tilde{\mathbf{s}}_{j}(\alpha_{j}f) \qquad \tilde{\mathbf{s}} = \sum_{j} c_{j} \tilde{\mathbf{s}}_{j} \equiv \tilde{\mathbf{n}} + \tilde{\mathbf{h}}_{22} + \tilde{\mathbf{h}}_{33}$$
$$h_{22} \in (0.623, 2)$$

- \* inspiral+merger+ringdown (IMR) waveform models in GR (M, spin) can be fixed
  - QNM, phase offsets, amplitudes for all modes in GR can be computed

Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS PRL 118, 161101 (2017) Black Hole Spectroscopy with Coherent Mode Stacking Huan Yang,<sup>1</sup> Kent Yagi,<sup>1</sup> Jonathan Blackman,<sup>2</sup> Luis Lehner,<sup>3,4</sup> Vasileios Paschalidis,<sup>1</sup> Frans Pretorius,<sup>1,4</sup> and Nicolás Yunes<sup>5</sup> <sup>1</sup>Department of Physics, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey 08544, USA <sup>2</sup>TAPIR, Walter Burke Institute for Theoretical Physics, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, California 91125, USA <sup>3</sup>Perimeter Institute for Theoretical Physics, Waterloo, Ontario N2L 2Y5, Canada <sup>4</sup>CIFAR, Cosmology and Gravity Program, Toronto, Ontario M5G 1Z8, Canada <sup>5</sup>eXtreme Gravity Institute, Department of Physics, Montana State University, Bozeman, Montana 59717, USA (Received 20 January 2017; published 20 April 2017)



 $(2/3)\omega_{33}$  for a=[0,1]







### Test of GR at Ringdown Phase

# "parametrized ringdown spin expansion coefficients" (ParSpec)

### PARSPEC

- Can we find a **consistent framework** to produce **generic constraints** valid for **specific modified theories** of gravity, without losing generality?
- **Perturbatively**: yes. Recently provided by Maselli, Pani, Gualtieri, Berti:



Gregorio Carullo https://dcc.ligo.org/P2000538

### PHYSICAL REVIEW D 101, 024043 (2020)

Parametrized ringdown spin expansion coefficients: A data-analysis framework for black-hole spectroscopy with multiple events

Andrea Maselli<sup>(1)</sup>,<sup>1</sup> Paolo Pani<sup>(1)</sup>,<sup>1</sup> Leonardo Gualtieri,<sup>1</sup> and Emanuele Berti<sup>(2)</sup> <sup>1</sup>Dipartimento di Fisica, "Sapienza" Università di Roma, Piazzale Aldo Moro 5, 00185, Roma, Italy <sup>2</sup>Department of Physics and Astronomy, John Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland 21218, USA

(Received 31 October 2019; published 22 January 2020)

### **THEORY PARAMETER SPACE**

• **p=0** (e.g. certain scalar-tensor or Lorentz-violating)

$$S_{\pounds} = \frac{1}{16\pi G_{\pounds}} \int \sqrt{-g} \left( R - M^{\alpha\beta}{}_{\mu\nu} \nabla_{\alpha} u^{\mu} \nabla_{\beta} u^{\nu} \right) d^4x$$

• **p=2** (e.g. **Kerr-Newman** or Dark photon)

$$\mathcal{L} = \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{R}{16\pi} - \frac{1}{4} F_{\mu\nu} F^{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{4} B_{\mu\nu} B^{\mu\nu} + 4\pi e j_{\rm em}^{\mu} A_{\mu} + 4\pi e_h j_h^{\mu} B_{\mu} + 4\pi \epsilon e j_h^{\mu} A_{\mu\nu} B^{\mu\nu} + 4\pi e_h j_h^{\mu} B_{\mu\nu} + 4\pi \epsilon e j_h^{\mu} A_{\mu\nu} B^{\mu\nu} + 4\pi \epsilon$$

• p=4 (e.g. Einstein-scalar-Gauss-Bonnet or dynamical Chern-Simons)

$$S \equiv \int \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left[ R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 + 2\alpha_{\rm GB} f(\vartheta) \mathcal{R}_{\rm GB} \right], \quad S \equiv \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1}{2} (\partial \vartheta)^2 \right) d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left( \frac{m_{\rm pl}^2}{2} R - \frac{1$$

• **p=6** (e.g. Effective Field Theories)

$$S_{\rm eff} = \int d^4 x \sqrt{-g} 2M_{\rm pl}^2 \left( R - \frac{\mathcal{C}^2}{\Lambda^6} - \frac{\tilde{\mathcal{C}}^2}{\tilde{\Lambda}^6} - \frac{\tilde{\mathcal{C}}\mathcal{C}}{\Lambda^6} \right)$$

14









Hisaaki Shinkai @ Group A Winter Camp 2021; 2021-Feb-06

# **Public Data Release**





